

1 HANSON BRIDGETT MARCUS VLAHOS & RUDY, LLP
KURT A. FRANKLIN - 172715
2 SARAH D. MOTT - 148597
MOLLY A. LEE - 232477
3 kfranklin@hansonbridgett.com
smott@hansonbridgett.com
4 mlee@hansonbridgett.com
425 Market Street, 26th Floor
5 San Francisco, CA 94105
Telephone: (415) 777-3200
6 Facsimile: (415) 541-9366

7 Attorneys for Defendants
HARVEST REDWOOD RETIREMENT RESIDENCE,
8 L.L.C., doing business as Redwood Retirement Residence,
RETIREMENT RESIDENCE, L.L.C.; and HOLIDAY
9 RETIREMENT CORP.

10 BRANCART & BRANCART
CHRISTOPHER BRANCART (SBN 128475)
11 LIZA CRISTOL-DEMAN (SBN 190516)
Post Office Box 686
12 Pescadero, CA 94060
cbrancart@brancart.com
13 lcristoldeman@brancart.com
Telephone: (650) 879-0141
14 Fax: (650) 879-1103

15 Attorneys for all Plaintiffs

16 PROTECTION & ADVOCACY, INC.
STUART SEABORN (SBN 198590)
17 DARA SCHUR (SBN 98638)
ERIC GELBER (SBN 95256)
18 100 Howe Ave. Suite 235N
Sacramento, CA 95825
19 stuart.seaborn@pai-ca.org
Telephone: (916) 488-9950
20 Fax: (916) 488-9960

21 Attorneys for Ruby Duncan, Eva Northern
and Class Plaintiffs Only

22
23 **UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**
24 **FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**
25
26
27
28

GREATER NAPA FAIR HOUSING
CENTER, a California Not for Profit
Corporation, doing business as FAIR
HOUSING NAPA VALLEY, as an
individual entity only; EVA NORTHERN,
an incompetent adults, by and through her
Guardian ad Litem, NANCY
NORTHERN; MARIE BROMAN; and AL
FOURNIER, each individually and on
behalf of individuals similarly situated;
NANCY NORTHERN, in her individual
capacity only; and LOUISE WHITAKER,
in her individual capacity and as Successor
in Interest to Ruby Duncan,

Plaintiffs,

v.

HARVEST REDWOOD RETIREMENT
RESIDENCE, L.L.C., doing business as
Redwood Retirement Residence;
REDWOOD RETIREMENT RESIDENCE
L.L.C.; and HOLIDAY RETIREMENT
CORP.,

Defendants.

No. C 07 3652 PJH

**[PROPOSED] STIPULATED
PROTECTIVE ORDER**

1. PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS

Disclosure and discovery activity in this action are likely to involve production of confidential, proprietary, or private information for which special protection from public disclosure and from use for any purpose other than prosecuting this litigation would be warranted. Accordingly, the parties hereby stipulate to and petition the court to enter the following Stipulated Protective Order. The parties acknowledge that this Order does not confer blanket protections on all disclosures or responses to discovery and that the protection it affords extends only to the limited information or items that are entitled under the applicable legal principles to treatment as confidential. The parties further acknowledge, as set forth in Section 10, below, that this Stipulated Protective Order creates no entitlement to file confidential information under seal; Civil Local Rule 79-5 sets forth the procedures that must be followed and reflects the standards that will be applied when a party seeks permission from the court to file material under seal.

1 2. DEFINITIONS

2 2.1 Party: any party to this action, including all of its officers, directors,
3 employees, consultants, retained experts, and outside counsel (and their support staff).

4 2.2 Disclosure or Discovery Material: all items or information, regardless of
5 the medium or manner generated, stored, or maintained (including, among other things,
6 testimony, transcripts, or tangible things) that are produced or generated in disclosures or
7 responses to discovery in this matter.

8 2.3 "Confidential" Information or Items: information (regardless of how
9 generated, stored or maintained) or tangible things that qualify for protection under standards
10 developed under F.R.Civ.P. 26(c).

11 2.4 "Highly Confidential – Attorneys' Eyes Only" Information or Items:
12 extremely sensitive "Confidential Information or Items" whose disclosure to another Party or
13 non-party would create a substantial risk of serious injury that could not be avoided by less
14 restrictive means.

15 2.5 Receiving Party: a Party that receives Disclosure or Discovery Material
16 from a Producing Party.

17 2.6 Producing Party: a Party or non-party that produces Disclosure or
18 Discovery Material in this action.

19 2.7 Designating Party: a Party or non-party that designates information or
20 items that it produces in disclosures or in responses to discovery as "Confidential" or "Highly
21 Confidential — Attorneys' Eyes Only."

22 2.8 Protected Material: any Disclosure or Discovery Material that is
23 designated as "Confidential" or as "Highly Confidential – Attorneys' Eyes Only."

24 2.9 Outside Counsel: attorneys who are not employees of a Party but who are
25 retained to represent or advise a Party in this action.

26 2.10 House Counsel: attorneys who are employees of a Party.

27 2.11 Counsel (without qualifier): Outside Counsel and House Counsel (as well
28 as their support staffs).

1 2.12 Expert: a person with specialized knowledge or experience in a matter
2 pertinent to the litigation who has been retained by a Party or its counsel to serve as an expert
3 witness or as a consultant in this action and who is not a past or a current employee of a Party or
4 of a competitor of a Party's and who, at the time of retention, is not anticipated to become an
5 employee of a Party or a competitor of a Party's. This definition includes a professional jury or
6 trial consultant retained in connection with this litigation.

7 2.13 Professional Vendors: persons or entities that provide litigation support
8 services (e.g., photocopying; videotaping; translating; preparing exhibits or demonstrations;
9 organizing, storing, retrieving data in any form or medium; etc.) and their employees and
10 subcontractors.

11 3. SCOPE

12 The protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order cover not only Protected Material
13 (as defined above), but also any information copied or extracted therefrom, as well as all copies,
14 excerpts, summaries, or compilations thereof, plus testimony, conversations, or presentations by
15 parties or counsel to or in court or in other settings that might reveal Protected Material.

16 4. DURATION

17 Even after the termination of this litigation, the confidentiality obligations imposed by this
18 Order shall remain in effect until a Designating Party agrees otherwise in writing or a court order
19 otherwise directs.

20 5. DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL

21 5.1 Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection.

22 Each Party or non-party that designates information or items for protection under this Order must
23 take care to limit any such designation to specific material that qualifies under the appropriate
24 standards. A Designating Party must take care to designate for protection only those parts of
25 material, documents, items, or oral or written communications that qualify – so that other portions
26 of the material, documents, items, or communications for which protection is not warranted are
27 not swept unjustifiably within the ambit of this Order.

28 Mass, indiscriminate, or routinized designations are prohibited. Designations that are

1 shown to be clearly unjustified, or that have been made for an improper purpose (e.g., to
2 unnecessarily encumber or retard the case development process, or to impose unnecessary
3 expenses and burdens on other parties), expose the Designating Party to sanctions.

4 If it comes to a Party's or a non-party's attention that information or items that it
5 designated for protection do not qualify for protection at all, or do not qualify for the level of
6 protection initially asserted, that Party or non-party must promptly notify all other parties that it is
7 withdrawing the mistaken designation.

8 5.2 Manner and Timing of Designations. Except as otherwise provided in this
9 Order (see, e.g., second paragraph of section 5.2(a), below), or as otherwise stipulated or ordered,
10 material that qualifies for protection under this Order must be clearly so designated before the
11 material is disclosed or produced.

12 Designation in conformity with this Order requires:

13 (a) for information in documentary form (apart from transcripts of
14 depositions or other pretrial or trial proceedings), that the Producing Party affix the legend
15 "CONFIDENTIAL" or "HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS' EYES ONLY" at the top
16 of each page that contains protected material. If only a portion or portions of the material on a
17 page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly identify the protected
18 portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the margins) and must specify, for each
19 portion, the level of protection being asserted (either "CONFIDENTIAL" or "HIGHLY
20 CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS' EYES ONLY").

21 A Party or non-party that makes original documents or materials available for inspection
22 need not designate them for protection until after the inspecting Party has indicated which
23 material it would like copied and produced. During the inspection and before the designation, all
24 of the material made available for inspection shall be deemed "HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL –
25 ATTORNEYS' EYES ONLY." After the inspecting Party has identified the documents it wants
26 copied and produced, the Producing Party must determine which documents, or portions thereof,
27 qualify for protection under this Order, then, before producing the specified documents, the
28 Producing Party must affix the appropriate legend ("CONFIDENTIAL" or "HIGHLY

1 CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS’ EYES ONLY”) at the top of each page that contains
2 Protected Material. If only a portion or portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection,
3 the Producing Party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making
4 appropriate markings in the margins) and must specify, for each portion, the level of protection
5 being asserted (either “CONFIDENTIAL” or “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS’
6 EYES ONLY”).

7 (b) for testimony given in deposition or in other pretrial or trial
8 proceedings, that the Party or non-party offering or sponsoring the testimony identify on the
9 record, before the close of the deposition, hearing, or other proceeding, all protected testimony,
10 and further specify any portions of the testimony that qualify as “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL –
11 ATTORNEYS’ EYES ONLY.” When it is impractical to identify separately each portion of
12 testimony that is entitled to protection, and when it appears that substantial portions of the
13 testimony may qualify for protection, the Party or non-party that sponsors, offers, or gives the
14 testimony may invoke on the record (before the deposition or proceeding is concluded) a right to
15 have up to 20 days to identify the specific portions of the testimony as to which protection is
16 sought and to specify the level of protection being asserted (“CONFIDENTIAL” or “HIGHLY
17 CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS’ EYES ONLY”). Only those portions of the testimony that
18 are appropriately designated for protection within the 20 days shall be covered by the provisions
19 of this Stipulated Protective Order.

20 Transcript pages containing Protected Material must be separately bound by the court
21 reporter, who must affix to the top of each such page the legend “CONFIDENTIAL” or
22 “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS’ EYES ONLY,” as instructed by the Party or non-
23 party offering or sponsoring the witness or presenting the testimony.

24 (c) for information produced in some form other than documentary,
25 and for any other tangible items, that the Producing Party affix in a prominent place on the
26 exterior of the container or containers in which the information or item is stored the legend
27 “CONFIDENTIAL” or “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS’ EYES ONLY.” If only
28 portions of the information or item warrant protection, the Producing Party, to the extent

1 practicable, shall identify the protected portions, specifying whether they qualify as
2 “Confidential” or as “Highly Confidential — Attorneys’ Eyes Only.”

3 5.3 Inadvertent Failures to Designate. If timely corrected, an inadvertent
4 failure to designate qualified information or items as “Confidential” or “Highly Confidential —
5 Attorneys’ Eyes Only” does not, standing alone, waive the Designating Party’s right to secure
6 protection under this Order for such material. If material is appropriately designated as
7 “Confidential” or “Highly Confidential — Attorneys’ Eyes Only” after the material was initially
8 produced, the Receiving Party, on timely notification of the designation, must make reasonable
9 efforts to assure that the material is treated in accordance with the provisions of this Order.

10 6. CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS

11 6.1 Timing of Challenges. Unless a prompt challenge to a Designating Party’s
12 confidentiality designation is necessary to avoid foreseeable substantial unfairness, unnecessary
13 economic burdens, or a later significant disruption or delay of the litigation, a Party does not
14 waive its right to challenge a confidentiality designation by electing not to mount a challenge
15 promptly after the original designation is disclosed.

16 6.2 Meet and Confer. A Party that elects to initiate a challenge to a
17 Designating Party’s confidentiality designation must do so in good faith and must begin the
18 process by conferring directly (in voice to voice dialogue; other forms of communication are not
19 sufficient) with counsel for the Designating Party. In conferring, the challenging Party must
20 explain the basis for its belief that the confidentiality designation was not proper and must give
21 the Designating Party an opportunity to review the designated material, to reconsider the
22 circumstances, and, if no change in designation is offered, to explain the basis for the chosen
23 designation. A challenging Party may proceed to the next stage of the challenge process only if it
24 has engaged in this meet and confer process first.

25 6.3 Judicial Intervention. A Party that elects to press a challenge to a
26 confidentiality designation after considering the justification offered by the Designating Party
27 may file and serve a motion under Civil Local Rule 7 (and in compliance with Civil Local Rule
28 79-5, if applicable) that identifies the challenged material and sets forth in detail the basis for the

1 challenge. Each such motion must be accompanied by a competent declaration that affirms that
2 the movant has complied with the meet and confer requirements imposed in the preceding
3 paragraph and that sets forth with specificity the justification for the confidentiality designation
4 that was given by the Designating Party in the meet and confer dialogue.

5 The burden of persuasion in any such challenge proceeding shall be on the Designating
6 Party. Until the court rules on the challenge, all parties shall continue to afford the material in
7 question the level of protection to which it is entitled under the Producing Party's designation.

8 7. ACCESS TO AND USE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

9 7.1 Basic Principles. A Receiving Party may use Protected Material that is
10 disclosed or produced by another Party or by a non-party in connection with this case only for
11 prosecuting, defending, or attempting to settle this litigation. Such Protected Material may be
12 disclosed only to the categories of persons and under the conditions described in this Order.
13 When the litigation has been terminated, a Receiving Party must comply with the provisions of
14 section 11, below (FINAL DISPOSITION).

15 Protected Material must be stored and maintained by a Receiving Party at a location and
16 in a secure manner that ensures that access is limited to the persons authorized under this Order.

17 7.2 Disclosure of "CONFIDENTIAL" Information or Items. Unless otherwise
18 ordered by the court or permitted in writing by the Designating Party, a Receiving Party may
19 disclose any information or item designated CONFIDENTIAL only to:

20 (a) the Receiving Party's Outside Counsel of record in this action, as
21 well as employees of said Counsel to whom it is reasonably necessary to disclose the information
22 for this litigation and who have signed the "Agreement to Be Bound by Protective Order" that is
23 attached hereto as Exhibit A;

24 (b) the officers, directors, and employees (including House Counsel) of
25 the Receiving Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have
26 signed the "Agreement to Be Bound by Protective Order" (Exhibit A);
27
28

(c) experts (as defined in this Order) of the Receiving Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have signed the "Agreement to Be Bound by Protective Order" (Exhibit A);

(d) the Court and its personnel;

(e) court reporters, their staffs, and professional vendors to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have signed the "Agreement to Be Bound by Protective Order" (Exhibit A);

(f) during their depositions, witnesses in the action to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary and who have signed the "Agreement to Be Bound by Protective Order" (Exhibit A). Pages of transcribed deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal Protected Material must be separately bound by the court reporter and may not be disclosed to anyone except as permitted under this Stipulated Protective Order.

(g) the author of the document or the original source of the information.

7.3 Disclosure of "HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL — ATTORNEYS' EYES ONLY" Information or Items. Unless otherwise ordered by the court or permitted in writing by the Designating Party, a Receiving Party may disclose any information or item designated "HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL — ATTORNEYS' EYES ONLY" only to:

the Receiving Party's Outside Counsel of record in this action, as well as employees of said Counsel to whom it is reasonably necessary to disclose the information for this litigation and who have signed the "Agreement to Be Bound by Protective Order" that is attached hereto as Exhibit A;

(a) Experts (as defined in this Order) (1) to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation, (2) who have signed the "Agreement to Be Bound by Protective Order" (Exhibit A), [*Optional:* and (3) as to whom the procedures set forth in paragraph 7.4, below, have been followed];

(b) the Court and its personnel;

1 (c) court reporters, their staffs, and professional vendors to whom
2 disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have signed the "Agreement to Be
3 Bound by Protective Order" (Exhibit A); and

4 (d) the author of the document or the original source of the
5 information. [Optional:

6 7.4 Procedures for Approving Disclosure of "HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL —
7 ATTORNEYS' EYES ONLY" Information or Items to "Experts"

8 (a) Unless otherwise ordered by the court or agreed in writing by the
9 Designating Party, a Party that seeks to disclose to an "Expert" (as defined in this Order) any
10 information or item that has been designated "HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL — ATTORNEYS'
11 EYES ONLY" first must make a written request to the Designating Party that (1) identifies the
12 specific HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL information that the Receiving Party seeks permission to
13 disclose to the Expert, (2) sets forth the full name of the Expert and the city and state of his or her
14 primary residence, (3) attaches a copy of the Expert's current resume, (4) identifies the Expert's
15 current employer(s), (5) identifies each person or entity from whom the Expert has received
16 compensation for work in his or her areas of expertise or to whom the expert has provided
17 professional services at any time during the preceding five years, and (6) identifies (by name and
18 number of the case, filing date, and location of court) any litigation in connection with which the
19 Expert has provided any professional services during the preceding five years.

20 (b) A Party that makes a request and provides the information specified
21 in the preceding paragraph may disclose the subject Protected Material to the identified Expert
22 unless, within seven court days of delivering the request, the Party receives a written objection
23 from the Designating Party. Any such objection must set forth in detail the grounds on which it is
24 based.

25 (c) A Party that receives a timely written objection must meet and
26 confer with the Designating Party (through direct voice to voice dialogue) to try to resolve the
27 matter by agreement. If no agreement is reached, the Party seeking to make the disclosure to the
28 Expert may file a motion as provided in Civil Local Rule 7 (and in compliance with Civil Local

1 Rule 79-5, if applicable) seeking permission from the court to do so. Any such motion must
2 describe the circumstances with specificity, set forth in detail the reasons for which the disclosure
3 to the Expert is reasonably necessary, assess the risk of harm that the disclosure would entail and
4 suggest any additional means that might be used to reduce that risk. In addition, any such motion
5 must be accompanied by a competent declaration in which the movant describes the parties'
6 efforts to resolve the matter by agreement (i.e., the extent and the content of the meet and confer
7 discussions) and sets forth the reasons advanced by the Designating Party for its refusal to
8 approve the disclosure.

9 In any such proceeding the Party opposing disclosure to the Expert shall bear the burden
10 of proving that the risk of harm that the disclosure would entail (under the safeguards proposed)
11 outweighs the Receiving Party's need to disclose the Protected Material to its Expert.

12 **8. PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED PRODUCED IN**
13 **OTHER LITIGATION.**

14 If a Receiving Party is served with a subpoena or an order issued in other litigation that
15 would compel disclosure of any information or items designated in this action as
16 "CONFIDENTIAL" or "HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL — ATTORNEYS' EYES ONLY," the
17 Receiving Party must so notify the Designating Party, in writing (by fax, if possible) immediately
18 and in no event more than three court days after receiving the subpoena or order. Such
19 notification must include a copy of the subpoena or court order.

20 The Receiving Party also must immediately inform in writing the Party who caused the
21 subpoena or order to issue in the other litigation that some or all the material covered by the
22 subpoena or order is the subject of this Protective Order. In addition, the Receiving Party must
23 deliver a copy of this Stipulated Protective Order promptly to the Party in the other action that
24 caused the subpoena or order to issue.

25 The purpose of imposing these duties is to alert the interested parties to the existence of
26 this Protective Order and to afford the Designating Party in this case an opportunity to try to
27 protect its confidentiality interests in the court from which the subpoena or order issued. The
28 Designating Party shall bear the burdens and the expenses of seeking protection in that court of its

1 confidential material – and nothing in these provisions should be construed as authorizing or
2 encouraging a Receiving Party in this action to disobey a lawful directive from another court.

3 9. UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

4 If a Receiving Party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed Protected
5 Material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this Stipulated Protective
6 Order, the Receiving Party must immediately (a) notify in writing the Designating Party of the
7 unauthorized disclosures, (b) use its best efforts to retrieve all copies of the Protected Material, (c)
8 inform the person or persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were made of all the terms of this
9 Order, and (d) request such person or persons to execute the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to
10 Be Bound” that is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

11 10. FILING PROTECTED MATERIAL.

12 Without written permission from the Designating Party or a court order secured after
13 appropriate notice to all interested persons, a Party may not file in the public record in this action
14 any Protected Material. A Party that seeks to file under seal any Protected Material must comply
15 with Civil Local Rule 79-5.

16 11. FINAL DISPOSITION.

17 Unless otherwise ordered or agreed in writing by the Producing Party, within sixty days
18 after the final termination of this action, each Receiving Party must return all Protected Material
19 to the Producing Party. As used in this subdivision, “all Protected Material” includes all copies,
20 abstracts, compilations, summaries or any other form of reproducing or capturing any of the
21 Protected Material. With permission in writing from the Designating Party, the Receiving Party
22 may destroy some or all of the Protected Material instead of returning it. Whether the Protected
23 Material is returned or destroyed, the Receiving Party must submit a written certification to the
24 Producing Party (and, if not the same person or entity, to the Designating Party) by the sixty day
25 deadline that identifies (by category, where appropriate) all the Protected Material that was
26 returned or destroyed and that affirms that the Receiving Party has not retained any copies,
27 abstracts, compilations, summaries or other forms of reproducing or capturing any of the
28 Protected Material. Notwithstanding this provision, Counsel are entitled to retain an archival

1 copy of all pleadings, motion papers, transcripts, legal memoranda, correspondence or attorney
2 work product, even if such materials contain Protected Material. Any such archival copies that
3 contain or constitute Protected Material remain subject to this Protective Order as set forth in
4 Section 4 (DURATION), above.

5 12. MISCELLANEOUS

6 12.1 Right to Further Relief. Nothing in this Order abridges the right of any
7 person to seek its modification by the Court in the future.

8 12.2 Right to Assert Other Objections. By stipulating to the entry of this
9 Protective Order no Party waives any right it otherwise would have to object to disclosing or
10 producing any information or item on any ground not addressed in this Stipulated Protective
11 Order. Similarly, no Party waives any right to object on any ground to use in evidence of any of
12 the material covered by this Protective Order.

13 IT IS SO STIPULATED, THROUGH COUNSEL OF RECORD.

14 DATED: December 12, 2007 /s/ Liza Cristol-Deman
15 Attorneys for Plaintiffs

16 DATED: December 12, 2007 /s/ Kurt A. Franklin
17 Attorneys for Defendants

18
19 PURSUANT TO STIPULATION, IT IS SO ORDERED.

20 DATED: _____
21 Hon. Phyllis J. Hamilton
22 United States District Judge